
Jody L. Herman, Ph.D.
Scholar of Public Policy
Williams Institute, UCLA School of Law
WHY COLLECT GENDER IDENTITY DATA?

- Demonstrate existence of gender minorities
- Learn about the size and characteristics of the gender minority population
- Increase visibility and destigmatize
- Understand disparities of gender minority populations compared to others (economic, health, social, etc.) and experiences of discrimination/stigma
- Inform the development of laws, policies, and programs that impact gender minority people
Gender Identity in U.S. Surveillance (GenIUSS)

Mission: To increase and better understand population-based data about transgender people through the inclusion of gender-related measures (i.e., sex assigned at birth, gender identity, gender expression, transgender status) on population-based surveys, with particular consideration for publicly funded data collection efforts.

Activities: GenIUSS will accomplish its mission by conducting rigorous, scientific research on gender-related measures and making recommendations regarding measurement research and data collection.
GenIUSS GROUP MEMBERS

• Steering Committee
  Kerith Conron          Gary Gates
  Scout                   Jody Herman

• GenIUSS Group Members
  Bryn Austin            Mara Keisling
  M.V. Lee Badgett       Emilia Lombardi
  Kellan E. Baker        Phoenix Matthews
  Kylar Broadus          Sari Reisner
  David H. Chae          Diego M. Sanchez
  Paisley Currah         Kristen Schilt
  Masen Davis            Gunner Scott
  Alison Gill            Ben Singer
  Emily Greytak          Susan Stryker
  JoAnne Keatley         Bali White
CONSIDERATIONS FOR GENDER IDENTITY MEASURES ON POPULATION-BASED SURVEYS

1) Correctly identify people who are not gender minorities as not being gender minority (e.g., identify cisgender people as cisgender and not transgender)

2) Correctly identify gender minority respondents as gender minorities (e.g. identify transgender people as transgender and not cisgender)
GenIUSS RECOMMENDED MEASURE
(Two-step Measure)

1. What sex were you assigned at birth, on your original birth certificate?
   - Male
   - Female

2. How do you describe yourself? (check one)
   - Male
   - Female
   - Transgender
   - Do not identify as female, male, or transgender

(Based on the work of Reisner SL, Conron KJ, Tardiff LA, Jarvi J, Austin SB, 2013; Lombardi E, Banik S, Mitchell K, Zuber J)
Some people describe themselves as transgender when they experience a different gender identity from their sex at birth. For example, a person born into a male body, but who feels female or lives as a woman.

Do you consider yourself to be transgender?
- Yes, transgender, male to female
- Yes, transgender, female to male
- Yes, transgender, gender non-conforming
- No

(Conron; MA BRFSS; Reisner SL, Conron KJ, Tardiff LA, Jarvi J, Austin SB, 2013)
EXPLORING INTERNATIONAL PRIORITIES AND BEST PRACTICES FOR GENDER IDENTITY DATA COLLECTION

June 17th, 2016 Data Collection Meeting Amsterdam

• Develop a network of academics and other experts who study the collection of data about gender minorities
• Determine the desirability and feasibility of developing a set of international best practices for the collection of data about gender minorities
• Consider what an international best practices model might look like and determine what additional considerations and steps are needed before beginning to develop these best practices
EXPLORING INTERNATIONAL PRIORITIES AND BEST PRACTICES FOR GENDER IDENTITY DATA COLLECTION

• Steering Committee
  Greta Bauer  JoAnne Keatley
  Walter Bockting  Andrew Park
  Jamison Green  Sari Reisner
  Jody Herman  Sam Winter

• Meeting Participants
  Lukas Berredo  Joz Motmans  Ayden Scheim
  Angelo Brandelli Costa  Timo Nieder  Alfonso Silva-Santisteban
  Madeline Deutsch  N. Nicole Nussbaum  Amets Suess Schwend
  Rebecca Fox  Robert Oelrichs  Wim Vanden Berghe
  Jack Harrison-Quintana  Asa Radix  Jaime Veale
  Yuko Higashi  Bernard Reed  Joe Wong
  Marc Lachance  Elizabeth Saewyc
CURRENT DATA COLLECTION EFFORTS
(Official Government Activities)

• Asia and the Pacific
  o New Zealand
    ▪ Statistics New Zealand
  o India & Nepal
    ▪ Third Gender

• Europe
  o EU Agency for Fundamental Rights
    ▪ LGBT Survey
  o UK
    ▪ NHS England
    ▪ Equality & Human Rights Commission
  o Netherlands
    ▪ Institute for Social Research

• Latin America
  o Uruguay
    ▪ Trans Census (MSD)
  o Brazil
    ▪ Admin Systems

• North America
  o Canada
    ▪ Statistics Canada
    ▪ 2021 Census
  o United States
    ▪ BRFSS & YRBS
    ▪ NCVS
    ▪ State-level surveys (CHIS)
ARE INTERNATIONAL BEST PRACTICES DESIRABLE? FEASIBLE?

Yes, they are desirable
• Provide guidance for data collection efforts
• Foster comparability across countries
• Hold governments accountable

Yes, they are feasible
• Involve affected communities
• Safety of gender minority communities
• Cross-cultural concerns
• Institutional support
RECOMMENDATIONS

We recommend that governments and international institutions...

• Engage in and provide support for collection of data about gender minorities and data analysis
• Consider the inclusion and active participation of gender minority communities in the process of supporting data collection and analysis
• Consider the safety of gender minorities when considering and conducting data collection and analysis
Best Practices for Asking Questions to Identify Transgender and Other Gender Minority Respondents on Population-Based Surveys

Exploring International Priorities and Best Practices for the Collection of Data about Gender Minorities

Available at: http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/
Issues in developing trans-inclusive sex/gender measures

Greta Bauer, PhD, MPH

Associate Professor and Graduate Chair
Epidemiology & Biostatistics
Schulich School of Medicine & Dentistry
Western University
London, Ontario

22 June 2017
Williams Institute Webinar:
Collecting Data About Gender Identity
Inclusion is urgently needed to remedy long-standing erasure

All of this time that I’ve survived, I’m one of the walking dead because we’re not counted; we’re not represented anywhere.

And what’s the word? Erasure – which all of [us] are familiar with as a theoretical and practical term. I don’t think this is theoretical; this is our lives.

Survey of \( n=311 \) who completed two surveys

Cognitive interviews with a maximum diversity sample of \( n=79 \)

Canadian context:
- Settler-colonial
- Multicultural
- \( \sim 20\% \) immigrant
- Multilingual
- Generational language differences
Set A: Multidimensional Sex/Gender Measure

Are you ... ?

☐ Male
☐ Female
☐ Something else, specify: ________________________

Do you consider yourself to be trans (transgender, transsexual, or a person with a history of transitioning sex)?

☐ Yes
☐ No
☐ Don’t know
Following questions are for only those who answered “Yes” or “Don’t know”:

What was your assigned sex at birth?

- Male
- Female
- Undetermined

What is your felt gender?

- Male or primarily masculine
- Female or primarily feminine
- Both male and female
- Neither male nor female
- Don’t know

Have you undertaken any of the following to medically transition sex? (Check all that apply)

- Hormone therapy
- Hair removal (electrolysis or laser)
- Mastectomy or chest reconstruction (an operating to remove breasts or construct a male chest)
- Breast augmentation (an operating to make breasts larger using implants)
- Hysterectomy (an operation to remove the uterus)
- Oophorectomy (an operation to remove the ovaries)
- Metoidioplasty (an operation to free the clitoris)
- Phalloplasty (an operation to construct a penis)
- Orchiectomy (an operation to remove the testicles)
- Vaginoplasty (an operation to construct a vagina)
- None of the above

What gender do you currently live as in your day-to-day life?

- Male
- Female
- Sometimes male, sometimes female
- Third gender, or something other than male or female
Set B: Two-step method

What is your current gender identity?

☐ Male
☐ Female
☐ Trans male/Trans man
☐ Trans female/Trans woman
☐ Genderqueer/Gender non-conforming
☐ Different identity (please specify): ________

What sex were you assigned at birth, meaning on your original birth certificate?

☐ Male
☐ Female
Issues

- Sensitivity of questions
- Potential confusion for cisgender participants
- Number of questionnaire items required
- Which dimensions of sex and gender are captured
- Transness vs. trans identity
- Capturing the largest number of trans people
- Gender non-conforming vs. non-binary vs. trans
- Capturing cultural gender identities
- Self-report vs. proxy reporting
- Translatability, ESL issues, stability of terminology
- Move to administrative censuses
Missings

- Two-step: 2 of 311 missing (0.6%)
  - 2 missing items
  - 1 additional unclassifiable into detailed categories ("somewhere between GQ and trans male")
- Multidimensional: 1 of 311 missing (0.3%)

Lesson: No major red flags for problems with skipping.
No major confusion on sex/gender items from cisgender participants

- **cisgender male**: Uh, truthfully... I found it easy.

- **cisgender female**: Um, well, I just kind of—I’ve never really felt like a guy, I guess.

**Lesson**: No red flags for cisgender confusion on any of the items.
Are you ... ?

- Male
- Female
- Something else (please specify)

Two pie charts are shown:

- **Transmasculine**
  - Male: 21%
  - Female: 19%
  - Other: 60%

- **Transfeminine**
  - Male: 9%
  - Female: 30%
  - Other: 61%

---

Lesson: While an “other” option provides some flexibility, trans people will not be identifiable from this kind of “trinary” classification. Even with an additional question assessing “trans-ness”, gender spectrum will not be identifiable.
But for me like I don’t, I recognize that I have transitioned but it’s not part of my identity. So, I don’t really identify as a trans person, if really push comes to shove, if I was in a doctor situation or whatever. But I generally do say like I’m a person with a history of like, a medical history whatever, more so.

Lesson: “Trans” must be defined to include those who do not identify with the label “trans”.

Participant:
20-29 yrs
White, Ontario
Trans, man
Lesson: For the dimension of gender identity, these two measures have near-perfect (chance-corrected) agreement.
Except … Cis woman or transmasculine?

- None of the 7 considered themselves trans when directly asked, but identify as genderqueer or gender non-conforming in response to the two-step questions
- Write-ins: “queer”, “female genderqueer questioning”

**Lesson**: A “genderqueer / gender non-conforming” option for identity in the two-step (version recommended for testing by GENIUSS) may be too broad and will capture cisgender women who are somewhat gender non-conforming.
Interviewer: Right. And so have you, have you told your family? Does your family know that you’re genderqueer?

Participant: No, no.

Well, my family is [religious] so that, that made it difficult to go one way or the other with it. ... but I think that’s the reason why I still, I still like, choose to identify my sex as female. [...] because my family is [religious] it’s easier for me to, like my sex, to identify it as female because then it’s, because otherwise it’s problematic.

Lesson: Potential issues with proxy reporting of gender identity by family or household members.
I do identify as Two-spirited, but sometimes that more gender fluid and gender — but having almost kind of like that balance of sometimes that I feel that I have—I’ll have a more of a masculine day and more—as compared to having more of a feminine day. ... it fluctuates, and it’s not that—that I think that I’m transgendered at all. I think whereas some people, they misunderstand that Two-spiritedness can be—is considered to be something under the transgender spectrum, when really it’s something that’s more of a spectrum in itself that is inclusive of sexuality and gender identity, gender diversities between gender and sexuality identities, but very exclusive to First Nations and Indigenous people. So—and sometimes it’s a lot—a little more complicated than just saying gender fluid [laughs].

**Lesson**: Traditional identities may be more “gender fluid” than “trans”, and more complicated than “gender fluid”. Different paradigm.
I actually am non-binary and for me being trans is a pretty broad term, which includes anyone whose—whose gender is different than their assigned sex at birth. And that’s not everyone’s understanding.

So I identify as genderqueer, which I think of as a separate thing from issues of transgender. ... And I understand that that’s not a hundred percent [laughs] how other people see that distinction, but that is basically how I have always understand that distinction.

**Lesson:** The only thing people agree on with non-binary vs. trans is that people don’t agree on the relationship between the two.
**Table 8-1 Dimensions of Sex and Gender**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transsexualism / transgenderism</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Gender</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Falls under trans umbrella (gender identity ≠ birth sex)</td>
<td>Chromosomal sex</td>
<td>Gender identity / felt gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trans identity * · **</td>
<td>Sex assigned at birth</td>
<td>Lived gender *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hormonal milieu **</td>
<td>Conventional masculinity or femininity · **</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Genital and reproductive organs **</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary sex characteristics **</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note.**
* May change over time with social transition
** May change over time with medical transition

Fig 3. Gender identity as a proxy for other dimension of sex/gender in trans persons.
Recommend for further testing/use in self-reported health surveys:
Multidimensional Sex/Gender Measure

Q1. What sex were you assigned at birth, meaning on your original birth certificate?

1 ○ Male
2 ○ Female

Q2. Which best describes your current gender identity?

1 ○ Male
2 ○ Female
3 ○ Indigenous or other cultural gender identity (e.g. two-spirit)
4 ○ Something else (e.g. gender fluid, non-binary)

The third question may be asked only of those who indicated a current gender identity different than their birth-assigned sex. If so, it can be forward-filled to code cisgender participants as living in their identified (and birth-assigned) sex/gender.

Q3. What gender do you currently live as in your day-to-day life?

1 ○ Male
2 ○ Female
3 ○ Sometimes male, sometimes female
4 ○ Something other than male or female

MSGM

- No anticipated confusion on the part of cisgender participants
- Avoids unnecessary options for sex assigned at birth
- Recognizes distinctiveness of Indigenous genders
- Does not differentiate between identities as men or trans men (or women or trans women)
- Simple wording, with language that may change over time or have meaning only to sub-groups kept to examples (also allows for different examples in different languages)
- Can be reworded for interviewer administration to include response options in the question
- Self-categorization by participants, acknowledging “best” option may not be their individual identity
- Separate open-ended item for entering identity prevents unclassifiable entries (e.g. “just me”, “human”, “gay”, “trans male” when AMAB)
- Not suitable for proxy-reporting in most cases
Additional consideration

- Move to administrative censuses – how are sex/gender data captured in administrative records
Jessica Braimoh, PhD  Ayden Scheim, PhD (c)  Christoffer Dharma, MSc

For consultation and feedback:

• Marcella Daye
• Suzanne Desjarlais
• Eric Diotte
• Fin Gareau
• Jody Herman
• Randy Jackson

• Liz James
• Marc Lachance
• Renee Masching
• Nicole Nussbaum
• Caitlyn Paget
• Jean-Pierre Seguin

For assistance:

• Sejutie Alam
• Rachel Giblon
THANK YOU!
Trans health project

discrimination and healthcare among
Brazilian transgender population

Angelo Brandelli Costa
Transgender in Brazil?

→ Travesti or transsexual (trans) men/women

- Assigned male
- Identifies as man, woman or travesti
- Affirms female gender
- Typically not undergoing genital modification
Millions flood Brazil for world's largest gay pride parade

In a carnival of colour and festive music, three and a half million revellers celebrate at the world's largest gay parade in São Paulo.
Trans-rights in Brazil

Covers:
• Hormone therapy
• Medical gender affirmation procedures
Trans health project

- Cross-sectional study
- Community informed survey
- Healthcare needs and access barriers
## Instrument

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A</th>
<th>Demographics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Parentality / Conjugality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Healthcare needs and access</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Hormones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td>Body modifications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>HIV and STIs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>Sexual health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td>Prejudice and discrimination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>Housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>Work and income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td>Substance use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L</td>
<td>Well-being</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Gender identity assessment

1. At birth you were assigned as

( ) Male

( ) Female

2. Which of the following best describes your current gender identity?

( ) Woman

( ) Men

( ) Trans woman

( ) Trans man

( ) Travesti

( ) Other, _______________
Data collection

Hospital-based

Facebook-based

Pesquisa Saúde Trans
Se você é mulher ou homem transexual, participe de uma pesquisa da Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul e da Universidade de São Paulo respondendo um questionário sobre a sua saúde.

98.528 pessoas alcançadas

Impulsionar publicação

Você, Eric Sager, Adriano Henrique Caetano, Andressa Mueller e outras 475 pessoas curtem isso.

112 compartilhamentos
## Demographics

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td>26.4 (18–65) Mdn 24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Racial/ethnic</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>70.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-white</td>
<td>29.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary</td>
<td>10.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>62.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tertiary</td>
<td>20.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-tertiary</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Participants

Sample

710 Respondents

Brazilian flag

+ 47

+ 51

+ 429

@ 183
Gender assigned at birth

Assigned male
65%

Assigned female
35%
# Gender identity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trans woman</td>
<td>25.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Woman</td>
<td>23.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Travesti</td>
<td>13.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trans man</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Man</td>
<td>9.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>8.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Cross-coded gender identity

Trans women: 61.9
- Trans woman: 42.2
- Woman: 37.4
- Travesti: 21.4

Trans men: 29.3
- Trans men: 68.3
- Men: 31.7

Other: 8.7
- Assigned Female: 63.5
- Assigned Male: 36.5
Participants

Sample

Respondents

710

1361

+ 47

@ 429

+ 51

@ 183
Exclusion criteria

Assigned male

Assigned female
Results - Mental health

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Depression</th>
<th>Low self-esteem</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trans women</td>
<td>58.8</td>
<td>33.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trans men</td>
<td>72.4</td>
<td>49.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>87.5</td>
<td>51.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Suicide ideation</th>
<th>Suicide attempt</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trans women</td>
<td>60.4</td>
<td>39.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trans men</td>
<td>69.9</td>
<td>44.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>67.6</td>
<td>37.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

72.9% trans-related

Ideations 4x

Attempts 14.5x

Botega, Marín-León, Oliveira, Barros, da Silva, & Dalgalarrondo, 2009
**Results - Trans-related violence**

### What?
- Physical intimidation and threats: 67
- Verbal harassment: 41.3
- Sexual harassment: 40.4
- Silent harassment: 20.2
- Physical violence: 19.6
- Sexual assault: 12.1

### Where?
- Street: 79.4
- Educational context: 53.3
- House or family: 35
- Work: 27.4

### Experienced?
- Yes: 86.8

### Reported the police?
- Yes: 10.2
Results - Impact of violence

- Physical or sexual assault: 70.16%
- Verbal harassment or threat: 60.3%
- No harassment or assault: 44.4%

Suicide ideation and suicide attempt rates are indicated in the diagram.
Results - Mental healthcare

### Ever consulted

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trans women</td>
<td>54.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trans men</td>
<td>58.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>48.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Satisfaction

#### Trans women

- Very Dissatisfied: 67.7%
- Dissatisfied: 32.3%
- Neutral: 43.0%
- Satisfied: 73.1%
- Very Satisfied: 26.9%

#### Trans men

- Very Dissatisfied: 57.0%
- Dissatisfied: 43.0%
- Neutral: 32.3%
- Satisfied: 67.7%
- Very Satisfied: 26.9%

#### Other

- Very Dissatisfied: 73.1%
- Dissatisfied: 43.0%
- Neutral: 32.3%
- Satisfied: 67.7%
- Very Satisfied: 26.9%
Results - Healthcare avoidance

Avoided healthcare when needed?

- Avoided: 43.2%
- Never avoided: 56.8%

Discriminated

- Discriminated: 58.7%
- Never discriminated: 41.3%

Healthcare discrimination
Healthcare Needs of and Access Barriers for Brazilian Transgender and Gender Diverse People

Authors

Angelo Brandelli Costa, Heitor Tome da Rosa Filho, Paola Fagundes Pase, Anna Martha Vaitses Fontanari, Ramiro Figueiredo Catelan, Andressa Mueller, Dhiordan Cardoso, Bianca Soll, Karine Schwarz, Maiko Abel Schneider, Daniel Augusto Mori Gagliotti, Alexandre Saadeh, Maria Inês Rodrigues Lobato, Henrique Caetano Nardi, Silvia Helena Koller

Original Paper

First Online: 01 November 2016
DOI: 10.1007/s10903-016-0527-7

Cite this article as:

102
Downloads
Trans health project
discrimination and healthcare among
Brazilian transgender population

Angelo Brandelli Costa
angelo.costa@pucrs.br